What happens if I use a squash instead of a true merge when performing one of the git tricks?

devblogs.microsoft.com/oldnewthing/20210706-00

July 6, 2021

Raymond Chen

A customer wanted to know which of the git tricks I've shared still work if you use a squash instead of a true merge. For example, in the case of splitting a file in two while preserving line history, can this be done with squashing?

Many of the git tricks exploit the way git walks the commit graph, and squashing creates a different graph from merging. Specifically, squashing *throws away all our hard work* in building a specific commit graph. Instead, squashing takes all the changes and squashes them together into a single commit. It's as if you made all the changes at one sitting and committed them as a unit.

On the other hand, squashing works just fine with the tricks that involve a single non-merge commit. It just replaces one non-merge commit with an identical one.

Trick	Squashable?	Notes
Merging instead of cherry-picking	No	Merging is the point
Building a commit manually out of a tree	Yes	Creates a single non-merge commit
Building a merge commit manually out of a tree	No	Result is a merge commit
Building a throwaway commit in order to perform a combined cherry-pick-squash	Yes	Creates a single non-merge commit
Changing a squash to a merge	No	Result is a merge commit (that's the whole point)
Squashing without git rebase	Yes	Creates a single non-merge commit

Resetting by reusing an earlier tree	No	Result is a commit that needs to be merged
Combining two files into one while preserving line history	No	Creates merge commits
Combining two files into one while preserving line history, via manual octopus merging	No	Creates merge commits
How do I split a file into two while preserving git line history?	No	Creates merge commits
How to split out pieces of a file while preserving git line history v1	No	Creates merge commits
How to split out pieces of a file while preserving git line history v2	No	Creates merge commits
How to duplicate a file while preserving git line history	No	Creates merge commits
Converting a rebase to a merge	No	Creates merge commits
How can I bulk-revert an entire repo to an earlier commit?	It depends	Method 1 uses a single non-merge commit, but method 2 uses a merge
How can I bulk-revert a subdirectory of a repo to an earlier commit?	Yes	Creates a single non-merge commit

Raymond Chen

Follow